



the governance-access-learning network

Cases and Materials Relating to Corruption

INDEX to Volume 1

Editor John Hatchard

A joint project of the Commonwealth Legal Education Association, The Commonwealth Magistrates' and Judges' Association, The Commonwealth Secretariat and TIRI

Funded by the BMZ Trust Fund for United Nations Development Programme for Accountability and Transparency in support of the Independent Corrupt Practices and Other Related Offences Commission of Nigeria

Editorial Contact: TIRI, 42 Madrid Road
London SW13 9PG
United Kingdom
Tel. +44 (0)77 98 915 659
Fax +44-(0)20 8241 1919
<http://www.tiri.org>

SUBJECT INDEX FOR VOLUME 1

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

Bias - judicial corruption - meaning and scope of judicial "bias"

Zardari and Bhutto v The State [Supreme Court of Pakistan, 2001] **Issue 3 p.34**

Judicial review - Commission of Enquiry into allegations of corruption - effect of commissioners acting outside the terms of their reference

Dayal v Yeung Sik Yuen [Supreme Court of Mauritius, 2002] **Issue 3 p.65**

Judicial Review - Constitutional power of the Attorney General to prosecute criminal offences - control of criminal prosecutions by judicial review

Republic v Attorney General ex parte Kipng'eno Arap Ng'eny [High Court of Kenya, 2001] **Issue 1 p.13**

Judicial review - scope of - whether judicial review will lie against the State President

Dayal v President of the Republic and Others [Supreme Court of Mauritius, 1998] **Issue 3 p.62**

Powers of anti-corruption commission - report on outcome of investigation to Commissioner of Police - whether power to comment on or evaluate the evidence - whether a right for persons affected to comment on the proposed report

Parker & Others v Anti-Corruption Commission [Supreme Court of Western Australia, 1999] **Issue 2 p.164**

Powers of anti-corruption commission - investigation by special investigator - whether findings were within the powers of the investigator - whether adoption of the findings and subsequent recommendations of the commission *ultra vires*

Parker & Others v Miller & Others [Supreme Court of Western Australia, 1998] **Issue 2 p.123**

ANTI-CORRUPTION AGENCIES

Constitutionality of the Kenya Anti-Corruption Authority (KACA) - separation of powers - whether unconstitutional for a serving High Court judge to head the Kenya Anti-Corruption Authority - impact on KACA

Stephen Mwai Gachiengo v Republic [High Court of Kenya, 2000] **Issue 1 p.7**

Constitutionality of power of the Independent Commission Against Corruption to order non-disclosure of details of investigations

Ming Pao Newspapers Ltd v Attorney General of Hong Kong [Judicial Committee of the Privy Council, 1996] **Issue 1 p.23**

Powers of anti-corruption commission - investigation by special investigator - whether findings were within the powers of the investigator - whether adoption of the findings and subsequent recommendations of the commission ultra vires - Application for *Certiorari*
Parker & Others v Miller & Others [Supreme Court of Western Australia, 1998] **Issue 2 p.123**

National Accountability Bureau (Pakistan) - powers of - whether National Accountability Bureau Ordinance 1999 created a parallel judicial system in contravention of the Constitution of Pakistan
Wali v Federation of Pakistan [Supreme Court of Pakistan, 2001] **Issue 4 p.6**

APPEAL

Power conferred on Chairman of the National Accountability Bureau to freeze property of an accused - whether in conflict with the independence of the Judiciary - constitutionality of the denial of a right of appeal - whether violative of the principles of Islamic injunctions
Wali v Federation of Pakistan [Supreme Court of Pakistan, 2001] **Issue 4 p.6**

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW

Arrest and detention - power of anti-corruption commission to detain suspects for extended period - whether contravenes constitutional rights - Constitution of Pakistan article 10
Wali v Federation of Pakistan [Supreme Court of Pakistan, 2001] **Issue 4 p.6**

Constitution of Solomon Islands - whether capable of creating a corruption offence without further legislation
R v Musuota [High Court of the Solomon Islands, 1997] **Issue 3 p.19**

Constitutionality of the Kenya Anti-Corruption Authority - separation of powers - whether unconstitutional for a serving High Court judge to head the Kenya Anti-Corruption Authority
Stephen Mwai Gachiengo v Republic [High Court of Kenya, 2000] **Issue 1 p.7**

Constitutional interpretation in relation to anti-corruption legislation
Taw Cheng Kong v Public Prosecutor [High Court, Singapore, 1998] **Issue 1 p.30**

Constitutionality of power of the Independent Commission Against Corruption to order non-disclosure of details of investigations
Ming Pao Newspapers Ltd v Attorney General of Hong Kong [Judicial Committee of the privy Council, 1996] **Issue 1 p.23**

Criminal law - whether a criminal offence can be created in a constitution
R v Musuota [High Court of the Solomon Islands, 1997] **Issue 3 p.19**

Discrimination - whether an offence of receiving a gratification outside Singapore and applying only to Singaporean citizens was discriminatory on the basis of citizenship

Taw Cheng Kong v Public Prosecutor [High Court, Singapore, 1998] **Issue 1 p.30**

Ex parte preservation (freezing) order - whether it unjustifiably limited the fair hearing component in the Constitution of South Africa - scope of public policy objectives

National Director of Public Prosecutions and Minister of Justice and Constitutional Development v Yasiem Mac Mohamed N.O. and Others [Constitutional Court of South Africa, 2003] **Issue 3 p.89**

Misconduct in public office - whether common law unconstitutional for uncertainty - principles to be adopted in determining the matter

Shum Kwok Sher v HKSAR [Court of Final Appeal of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, 2002] **Issue 2 p.105**

Prevention of Bribery Ordinance s.30 (Hong Kong) - constitutionality of power of the Independent Commission Against Corruption to order non-disclosure of details of investigations

Ming Pao Newspapers Ltd v Attorney General of Hong Kong [Judicial Committee of the Privy Council, 1996] **Issue 1 p.23**

Receipt of "gifts" by political leader - whether prohibition on receipt of gifts in violation of the constitution - whether the law discriminated against political leaders

R v Musuota [High Court of the Solomon Islands, 1997] **Issue 3 p.19**

CRIMINAL LAW

Acceptance of bribe by a government official - scope of the mens rea of the offence - section 121(c) Canadian Criminal Code

R v Hinchey [Supreme Court of Canada, 1996] **Issue 4 p.59**

Bribery - elements of the offence

R v Sole [High Court of Lesotho, 2002] **Issue 2 p.23**

"Consideration" - "corruptly accepting or obtaining any gift or consideration" meaning of -

R v Musuota [High Court of the Solomon Islands, 1997] **Issue 3 p.19**

Conspiracy to corrupt - presumption of corruption - whether presumption applies to charge of conspiracy to make corrupt payment to public servants

R v Attorney General, ex parte Rockall [Queen's Bench Division, UK, 1999] **Issue 3 p.74**

Constitution of the Solomon Islands - whether capable of creating a corruption offence without further legislation

R v Musuota [High Court of the Solomon Islands, 1997] **Issue 3 p.19**

"Corruptly" - conspiracy to corrupt - mens rea - whether offence involves an element of dishonesty

R v Godden-Smith [Court of Appeal (Criminal Division), UK, 2001] **Issue 4 p.102**

Criminal liability of corporations

R v Acres International Limited [High Court of Lesotho, 2002] **Issue 2 p.84**

Misconduct in public office - elements of the offence

Shum Kwok Sher v HKSAR [Court of Final Appeal of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, 2002] **Issue 2 p.105**

Misconduct in public office - scope of the offence

R v Musuota [High Court of the Solomon Islands, 1997] **Issue 3 p.19**

"Public servant" - whether phrase "public authorities of all descriptions" included the Crown - Prevention of Corruption Act 1916 (UK)

R v Natji [Court of Appeal (Criminal Division), UK, 2002] **Issue 4 p.116**

"State official" - meaning of

R v Sole [High Court of Lesotho, 2002] **Issue 2 p.23**

"Wilful default" - elements of the offence - need for the offence to ensure proper investigation of corruption cases - impact of creating a retrospective offence

Wali v Federation of Pakistan [Supreme Court of Pakistan, 2001] **Issue 4 p.6**

ELECTIONS

Right of voters to know the personal background of parliamentary candidates

Union of India v Association for Democratic Reforms [India, Supreme Court of India, 2001] **Issue 2 p.5**

Election Commission - power to order parliamentary candidates to divulge details of their financial assets and liabilities

Union of India v Association for Democratic Reforms [India, Supreme Court of India, 2001] **Issue 2 p.5**

Election Commission - power to investigate expenditure incurred by political parties

Union of India v Association for Democratic Reforms [India, Supreme Court of India, 2001] **Issue 2 p.5**

EVIDENCE AND PROCEDURE

Burden of Proof - extent of burden cast on defence to rebut presumption of bribery

Wanigasekera v Republic of Sri Lanka [Supreme Court of Sri Lanka, 1977] **Issue 1 p.42**

Burden of proof - maintaining a standard of living above that commensurate with official emoluments - adverse inferences in Prevention of Bribery Ordinance, section 10(1)(a) - whether section consistent with Bill of Rights

Attorney General v Hui Kin Hong [Court of Appeal of Hong Kong, 1995] **Issue 1 p.34**

Burden of proof - placing burden on the accused - criteria for determining whether such laws are valid

Wali v Federation of Pakistan [Supreme Court of Pakistan, 2001] **Issue 4 p.141**

Circumstantial evidence - principles to be applied

S v Ngunovandu [High Court of Namibia, 1996] **Issue 4 p.150**

Circumstantial evidence - weight to be given

R v Acres International Limited [High Court of Lesotho, 2002] **Issue 2 p.84**

Circumstantial evidence - weight to be given

R v Sole [High Court of Lesotho, 2002] **Issue 2 p.23**

Documents - admissibility of statements of accused in civil proceedings

R v Sole [High Court of Lesotho, 2002] **Issue 2 p.23**

Documents - confession obtained based on documents shown to accused during questioning - reliability of the documents and failure to produce them at trial - effect of

Taw Cheng Kong v Public Prosecutor [High Court, Singapore, 1998] **Issue 1 p.30**

Documents - deliberate failure of accused to produce foreign bank records - inferences to be drawn

R v Sole [High Court of Lesotho, 2002] **Issue 2 p.23**

Opinion evidence - principles for determining admissibility of

R v Sole [High Court of Lesotho, 2002] **Issue 2 p.23**

Plea bargaining - power of anti-corruption commission to undertake - principles to be applied

Wali v Federation of Pakistan [Supreme Court of Pakistan, 2001] **Issue 4 p.6**

Presumption of corruption - duty of judge when considering application of the presumption

Ngan Kai-Shui v The Queen [High Court, Hong Kong, 1973] **Issue 1 p.50**

Presumption of corruption - when presumption triggered- underlying policy

Public Prosecutor v Low Tiong Choon [High Court, Singapore, 1997] **Issue 1 p.41**

Presumption of corruption - whether presumption applied to charge of conspiracy to make corrupt payment to public servants

R v Attorney General, ex parte Rockall [Queen's Bench Division, UK, 1999] **Issue 3 p.74**

Presumption of innocence - whether violated by means of "reverse onus of proof" provisions - impact of jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights

R (on the application of Elliot) v Secretary of State for the Home Department [Divisional Court, UK, 2001] **Issue 4 p.125**

Privilege against self-incrimination - scope of

Taw Cheng Kong v Public Prosecutor [High Court, Singapore, 1998] **Issue 1 p.30**

Privilege against self-incrimination - whether common law right abrogated by section 13 Prevention of Bribery Ordinance

Chan Sze Ting and Lee Chin Ming v Hong Kong Special Administrative Region [Court of Final Appeal of the HKSAR, 1997] **Issue 3 p.83**

Multiple counts - whether it is appropriate to proceed with multiple counts all based on one overt act of corruption - procedure to be adopted in so determining

R v Musuota [High Court of the Solomon Islands, 1997] **Issue 3 p.19**

Right to silence - when right may be exercised

R v Sole [High Court of Lesotho, 2002] **Issue 2 p.23**

Silence of the accused - inferences to be drawn

R v Acres International Limited [High Court of Lesotho, 2002] **Issue 2 p.84**

Similar-fact evidence - formulation and application of the rule

R v Sole [High Court of Lesotho, 2002] **Issue 2 p.23**

EXTRADITION

Bribery - Extradition of applicant to Hong Kong ordered by Secretary of State - Hong Kong legislation included "reverse onus" provision - whether return would contravene rights enshrined in article 6 European Convention on Human Rights - whether reverse onus provisions violated the presumption of innocence

R (on the application of Elliot) v Secretary of State for the Home Department [Divisional Court, UK, 2001] **Issue 4 p.125**

The London Scheme for Extradition within the Commonwealth

Issue 1 p.4

JUDICIARY

Bangalore Principles of Judicial Conduct **Issue 3 p.5**

Judicial corruption - meaning and scope of judicial "bias"

Zardari and Bhutto v The State [Supreme Court of Pakistan, 2001] **Issue 3 p.34**

Responsibility of Judicial Officers **Issue 2 p.2**

JURISDICTION

Bases upon which a court may claim jurisdiction to try corruption offence
R v Sole [High Court of Lesotho, 2001] **Issue 1 p.51**

Whether an offence of receiving a gratification outside Singapore and applying only to Singaporean citizens was discrimination on the basis of citizenship - power of Parliament to pass legislation with extra-territorial effect
Taw Cheng Kong v Public Prosecutor [High Court, Singapore, 1998] **Issue 1 p.30**

PARLIAMENT

Parliamentary seat ordered vacated following conviction for corruption of sitting member - successful appeal against conviction - effect of
Attorney General v Jones [Queen's Bench Division, UK, 1999] **Issue 3 p.11**

Receipt of gifts of "gifts" by political leader - whether prohibition on receipt of gifts violated the constitution - whether the law discriminated against political leaders
R v Musuota [High Court of the Solomon Islands, 1997] **Issue 3 p.19**

PROCEEDS OF CRIME

Ex parte preservation (freezing) order - whether it unjustifiably limited the fair hearing component in the Constitution of South Africa - scope of public policy objectives
National Director of Public Prosecutions and Minister of Justice and Constitutional Development v Yasien Mac Mohamed N.O. and Others [Constitutional Court of South Africa, 2003] **Issue 3 p.89**

Power conferred on Chairman of the National Accountability Bureau to freeze property of an accused - whether in conflict with the independence of the Judiciary - constitutionality of the denial of a right of appeal
Wali v Federation of Pakistan [Supreme Court of Pakistan, 2001] **Issue 4 p.6**

SENTENCING

Acquittal of accused on more serious corruption charge - effect on sentence for lesser offence
R v Godden-Smith [Court of Appeal (Criminal Division), UK, 2001] **Issue 4 p.102**

Bribery of judicial officer - appropriate sentence - impact of mitigating circumstances - need for a deterrent sentence in such cases

S v Ngunovandu [High Court of Namibia, 1996] **Issue 4 p.150**

Bribery of prison officer - prison warder convicted of assisting prisoner to escape - appropriate sentence - principles to be applied

S v Davids [Cape Provincial Division, South Africa, 1998] **Issue 4 p.166**

Bribery of traffic officer - prevalence of the offence - abuse of position of trust - appropriate sentence

S v Mogotsi [Witwatersrand Local Division, South Africa, 1998] **Issue 4 p.167**

Conspiracy to fix result of football matches - general principles of sentencing - need for a deterrent sentence

Rajendran s/o Kurusamy & Others v Public Prosecutor [High Court of Singapore, 1998] **Issue 4 p.165**

Co-accused - impact on sentencing by the length of sentence imposed on co-accused -

R v Godden-Smith [Court of Appeal (Criminal Division), UK, 2001] **Issue 4 p.102**

Mitigation of sentence - senior police officer convicted of bribery - whether sentence manifestly excessive - impact of plea of guilty - "supergrass" - impact on sentence where accused assists authorities in their investigations

The Queen v Lai Kin-Keung [Court of Appeal of Hong Kong, 1996] **Issue 4 p.168**

Suspended prison sentence - whether appropriate in corruption cases

The Queen v Chan Koon-Kwok [Court of Hong Kong, 1990] **Issue 4 p.169**